1	Nabil L. Abu-Assal (SBN 136764)		
2	nabil@cypressllp.com Douglas P. Roy (SBN 241607)		
3	doug@cypressllp.com Daniel A. Corren (SBN 260486) dan@cypressllp.com CYPRESS LLP		
4	dan@cypressllp.com CYPRESS LLP		
5	1925 Century Park East, Suite 1700 Los Angeles, CA 90067 Telephone: 424-901-0123 Facsimile: 424-750-5100		
6	Facsimile: 424-901-0123 Facsimile: 424-750-5100		
7	Michael J. Smith (Pro Hac Vice)		
8	msmith@mikesmithlaw.com THE LAW FIRM OF MICHAEL J. SMITH		
9	AND ASSOCIATES, PLLC 70 Macomb Place, Suite 200 Mt. Clemens, MI 48043		
10	Mt. Clemens, MI 48043 Telephone: (586) 254-0200		
11	Attorneys for Defendant		
12			
13	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
14			
15	CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
16	ROBERT HUNTER BIDEN	Case No.: 2:23-cv-09430-SVW-PD	
17	Plaintiff,		
18	V.	DEFENDANT'S ANSWER	
19	PATRICK M. BYRNE	AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL	
20	Defendant.	DEMAND FOR SURT TRIAL	
21			
22		Complaint Filed: November 8, 2023	
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
	Case No. 2:23-cv-09430-SVW-PD		
	DEFENDANT'S ANSWER AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES		

NOW COMES undersigned, Attorneys for Defendant, Patrick M. Byrne, and for his Answer to Plaintiff's Complaint in the above-captioned case, states as follows:

4

### **INTRODUCTION**

5

6

1.

denies the balance of the allegations.

7 8

9

10 11

12

13

14

16

15

17

18 19

20

21 22

23 24

25

26

27 28

- In the Answer to Paragraph one (1) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits that Plaintiff brings an action for defamation. Defendant neither admits nor denies that he posted statements on social media concerning Plaintiff. Defenant
- In Answer to Paragraph two (2) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant neither admits nor denies that he posted statements on social media concerning Plaintiff. Defendant denies the balance of the allegations in this paragraph.
- In Answer to Paragraph three (3) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant 3. denies the allegations in this paragraph.

#### **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

- In Answer to Paragraph four (4) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant 4. admits that this court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1332.
- In Answer to Paragraph five (5) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant 5. admits that he is a resident and citizen of the State of Florida. Defendant neither admits nor denies the remaining allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations.
- In Answer to Paragraph six (6) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant 6. denies the allegations contained therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph seven (7) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant 7. neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.

1 | ve 3 | jun 4 | Pla 5 | co 6 | din 7 | all 8 | co 9 | km

8. In Answer to Paragraph eight (8) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant vehemently denies that he acted illegally and denies that he has subjected himself to jurisdiction in the State of California. Moreover, the Defendant vehemently denies Plaintiff suffers from damages attributable to Defendant. If Plaintiff suffers and continues to suffer damages as alleged by Plaintff, then those alleged damages are a direct result of Plaintff's actions and conduct in this world. As to the balance of the allegations in this paragraph, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein and leaves Plaintiff to its proofs.

#### **PARTIES**

- 9. In Answer to Paragraph nine (9) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- 10. In Answer to Paragraph ten (10) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits that he is a resident of the State of Florida only and that he was the chief executive officer of Overstock.com until August of 2019. Furthermore, Defendant admits that he was interviewed by Capitol Times Magazine in 2023. Furthermore, as to the balance of the allegations in this paragraph, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- 11. In Answer to Paragraph eleven (11) of Plaintiff's Complaint,
  Defendant denies that he is a "serial liar". As to the balance of this paragraph,
  Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason
  that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a
  belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.

12

10

19

24

28

- 12. In Answer to Paragraph twelve (12) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- 13. In Answer to Paragraph thirteen (13) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits that he has currently more than 300,000 followers on his social media platform. As to the balance of this paragraph, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph fourteen (14) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 14. Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph fifteen (15) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 15. Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph sixteen (16) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph seventeen (17) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 17. Defendant denies that he has made defamatory statements about Plaintiff. As to the balance of this paragraph, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.

8 9

10 11

12 13

14 15

16

17 18

19 20

21 22

23 24

25

26 27

28

- 18. In Answer to Paragraph eighteen (18) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits that he appeared in an interview in Capitol Times Magazine and denies the rest of the allegations contained therein for the reason the same are untrue.
- 19. In Answer to Paragraph nineteen (19) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits only that he appeared in an interview in Capitol Times Magazine, the contents of which speak for themselves. As to the balance of this paragraph, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph twenty (20) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 20. Defendant admits only that he appeared in an interview in Capitol Times Magazine, the contents of which speak for themselves. As to the balance of the allegations, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph twenty-one (21) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 21. Defendant admits only that he appeared in an interview in Capitol Times Magazine, the contents of which speak for themselves. Defendant denies that he made any false and/or defamatory statements as stated herein by Plaintiff.
- 22. In Answer to Paragraph twenty-two (22) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits only that he appeared in an interview in Capitol Times Magazine, the contents of which speak for themselves. Defendant denies that he made any intentional false statements about Plaintiff as stated herein. As to the balance of this paragraph, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.

8

9

12

13

14 15

16

17 18

19 20

21

22

23 24

25 26

27 28

- In Answer to Paragraph twenty-three (23) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 23. Defendant admits only that he appeared for an interview with Emerald Robinson on "The Absolute Truth," the contents of which speak for themselves. Defendant denies that he has made any defamatory statements or false accusations against Plaintiff. As to the balance of this paragraph, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- 24. In Answer to Paragraph twenty-four (24) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant admits only that he appeared for a follow-up interview with Emerald Robinson on "The Absolute Truth," the contents of which speak for themselves. Defendant denies he made any defamatory charges as alleged by Plaintiff in this paragraph. As to the balance of this paragraph, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph twenty-five (25) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 25. Defendant admits that he appeared in an interview in Capitol Times Magazine, the contents of which speak for themselves. Defendant admits that he appeared on The Alex Jones Show in July of 2023, the contents of which speak for themselves. As to the balance of this paragraph, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph twenty-six (26) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 26. Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph twenty-seven (27) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 27. Defendant neither admits nor denies that he posted statements on social media concerning Plaintiff. Defendant denies he has made any false and defamatory

5 6

4

7 8

9

10

11

12 13

14 15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23 24

25 26

27

28

statements about Plaintiff. To the extent that the remaining allegations in this paragraph contain mixed statements of fact and assertions of law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations.

- 28. In Answer to Paragraph twenty-eight (28) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein. As to the balance of the allegations in this paragraph that contain mixed statements of fact and assertions of law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations.
- In Answer to Paragraph twenty-nine (29) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph thirty (30) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant 30. neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- In Answer to Paragraph thirty-one (31) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 31. Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.

#### FIRST CLAIM FOR RELIEF

## (Defamation)

# (Against Defendant Byrne)

- 32. Defendant incorporates by reference paragraphs 1–31 above, as it set forth fully herein word for word.
- In Answer to Paragraph thirty-three (33) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 33. Defendant denies the allegations contained therein and that he has not made any false statements about Plaintiff. Defendant admits that he appeared in an interview in Capitol Times Magazine and neither admits nor denies that he posted statements on social media, and that such statements speak for themselves. As to the remaining

allegations in this paragraph that contain mixed statements of fact and assertions of law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained therein.

- 34. In Answer to Paragraph thirty-four (34) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies that he has made any defamatory about Plaintiff. As to the remaining allegations in this paragraph that contain mixed statements of fact and assertions of law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations.
- 35. In Answer to Paragraph thirty-five (35) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations that he made any false statements about Plaintiff. As to the balance of this paragraph that contain mixed statements of fact and assertions of law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations.
- 36. In Answer to Paragraph thirty-six (36) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein and leaves Plaintiff to its proofs.
- 37. In Answer to Paragraph thirty-seven (37) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- 38. In Answer to Paragraph thirty-eight (38) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies that he has made defamatory statements about Plaintiff. As to the balance of the allegations herein, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.
- 39. In Answer to Paragraph thirty-nine (39) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies that he has made false statements about Plaintiff. As to the balance of the allegations herein, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations contained herein, for the reason that the Defendant lacks sufficient

information and knowledge in which to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations therein.

- 40. In Answer to Paragraph forty (40) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies that he has made false claims as stated in this paragraph. As to the balance of the allegations in this paragraph that contain mixed statements of fact and assertions of law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations.
- 41. In Answer to Paragraph forty-one (41) of Plaintiff's Complaint,
  Defendant denies that he has made false accusations. As to the balance of the
  allegations in this paragraph that contain mixed statements of fact and assertions of
  law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations.
- 42. In Answer to Paragraph forty-two (42) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies that he has made false claims as stated in this paragraph. As to the balance of the allegations in this paragraph that contain mixed statements of fact and assertions of law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations.
- 43. In Answer to Paragraph forty-three (43) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies that he has made false statements as stated in this paragraph. As to the balance of the allegations in this paragraph that contain mixed statements of fact and assertions of law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations.
- 44. In Answer to Paragraph forty-four (44) of Plaintiff's Complaint,
  Defendant denies that he has made false accusations as stated in this paragraph. As
  to the balance of the allegations in this paragraph that contain mixed statements of
  fact and assertions of law, Defendant neither admits nor denies the allegations.
- 45. In Answer to Paragraph forty-five (45) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies that he acted wrongfully as stated herein. Moreover, the Defendant denies Plaintiff suffers from damages attributable to Defendant.
- 46. In Answer to Paragraph forty-six (46) of Plaintiff's Complaint, Defendant denies the allegations contained therein.

In Answer to Paragraph forty-seven (47) of Plaintiff's Complaint, 47. Defendant denies the allegations contained therein. WHEREFORE, Defendant respectfully requests that Plaintiff's complaint for damages for defamation be dismissed with prejudice and without recovery of any kind and that Defendant be awarded such additional equitable and legal relief as is appropriate including but not limited to costs and reasonable attorney fees so wrongfully suffered. AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES Defendant, Patrick M. Byrne, by his Attorneys, incorporates by reference his answer to Plaintiff's Complaint for Damages for Defamation and states unto this Honorable Court the following as his Affirmative Defenses: FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: PLAINTIFF IS A PUBLIC **FIGURE** Plaintiff, as a public figure, assumed the risk associated with his behavior and conduct, and that he would subject himself to scrutiny and criticism in the public forum. SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: TRUTH The alleged defamatory statements made by Defendant are true and thus serve as an absolute defense to defamation and are protected speech. THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: 1ST AMENDMENT Defendant has the right to petition and of free speech under the constitutions of the United States and the State of California, and this fundamental right serves as an affirmative defense to Plaintiff's allegations and claims. FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: GOOD FAITH/NO MALICE At all times, Defendant acted in good faith and without malice. FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: UNCLEAN HANDS

Plaintiff has failed to state a claim and/or cause of action.

1	Plaintiff's claims are barred in whole or in part by his unclean hands.	
2	SEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: FAILURE TO MITIGATE	
3	Plaintiff has failed to mitigate his alleged damages.	
4	EIGHTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: CLAIM IS TIME BARRED	
5	Plaintiff's claims are barred by the applicable Statute of Limitations and/or	
6	the Doctrine of Latches.	
7	ADDITIONAL AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES	
8	Defendant reserves the right to add additional defenses as they become	
9	known through discovery up until the time of trial.	
10	DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL	
11	Defendant respectfully requests a jury trial in this action.	
12	PRAYER FOR RELIEF	
13	WHEREFORE, Defendant prays as follows:	
14	1. That Plaintiff take nothing by reason of its complaint, that judgement be	
15	rendered in favor of Defendant;	
16	2. That Defendant be awarded his costs of suit incurred in defense of this	
17	action, including his reasonable attorneys' fees; and	
18	3. For such other relief as the Court deems proper.	
19		
20		
21	Dated: February 14, 2024 By: /s/ Michael J. Smith	
22	Michael J. Smith	
23	Attorney for Defendant PATRICK M. BYRNE	
24	PATRICK M. BYRNE	
25		
26		
27		
28		